UDC 342.92
DOI https://doi.org/10.32782/chern.v6.2023.18

N. O. Maksimentseva
Doctor of Law,
Associate Professor at the Department of Parliamentarism
National Institute of Public Administration and Civil Service
of the Taras Shevchenko National University
orcid.org/0000-0001-7774-1948

THE PRINCIPLES OF ADMINISTRATIVE LAW VS. THE PRINCIPLES OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION

The article analyses the approaches to defining the principles of administrative law and public administration. The author establishes that different schools of administrative law have specifics in terms of approaches to defining the concept of principles and their composition. However, there are common basic principles which are the main foundations for the formation and development of administrative law and which are common to all scientific approaches.

It is established that the definitions of the principles of public administration in different legal schools and approaches of scientific schools of public administration differ significantly from each other. This is primarily due to the existence of separate approaches to understanding the concept of public administration and its place in the system of administrative law. Some doctrines primarily enshrine the principles of public administration as the basic principle of administrative law, while others, on the contrary, define the principles of administrative law, and only then the basis of public administration follows from them.

The author provides his own definition of the concepts of principles of administrative law and principles of public administration and proves that in the context of development of public administration relations, influence of European law on the process of formation of both public administration and administrative law, the distinction between such concepts should be made in a clear interaction and understanding that principles are the general principles on which social relations are formed which subsequently require legal regulation. Therefore, the establishment of principles is primary in the system of regulatory and legal support for the further development of administrative law and public administration.

In the context of the post-war reconstruction of the state, it would be advisable to introduce a unified system for establishing general and special principles of administrative law and public administration, taking into account the European experience and the experience of the EU states.

Key words: general and special principles, principle of legality, principle of the rule of law, principle of good governance, principle of protection of human and civil rights and freedoms.

Максіменцева Н. О. **СПІВВІДНОШЕННЯ ПРИНЦИПІВ АДМІНІСТРАТИВНОГО ПРАВА ТА ПРИНЦИПІВ ПУБЛІЧНОГО АДМІНІСТРУВАННЯ**

У статті проаналізовано підходи до визначення принципів адміністративного права та публічного адміністрування. Встановлено, що різні школи адміністративного права мають особливості щодо підходів до визначення поняття принципів та їх склад. Проте є загальні базові принципи, які є основними засадами формування та розвитку адміністративного права, що є загальними для всіх наукових підходів.

Встановлено, що визначення принципів публічного адміністрування у різних правових шкіл та підходів наукових шкіл публічного адміністрування суттєво відрізняються один від одного. Перш за все, через наявність окремих підходів до розуміння поняття публічного адміністрування та його місця в системі адміністративного права. Окремі вчені первинно закріплюють принципи публічного адміністрування як базову засаду адміністративного права, а інші, навпаки, визначають засади адміністративного права, а лише потім з них випливає базис публічного адміністрування.

Автором надається власне визначення поняття принципи адміністративного права та принципи публічного адміністрування та доводиться, що в умовах розвитку відносин публічного адміністрування, впливу норм європейського права на процес формування як публічного управління, так і адміністративного права, розмежування таких поняття має відбуватись у чіткій взаємодії та розуміння, що принципи є загальними засадами, на яких формуються суспільні відносини, що у подальшому потребують правового регулювання. Отже встановлення принципів є первинним у системі нормативно-правового забезпечення подальшого розвитку норм адміністративного права та публічного адміністрування.

В умовах повоєнної відбудови держави доцільним буде запровадження єдиної системи встановлення загальних та спеціальних принципів адміністративного права та публічного адміністрування з урахуванням європейського досвіду та досвіду держав ЄС.

Ключові слова: загальні і спеціальні принципи, принцип законності, принцип верховенства права, принцип належного врядування, принцип захисту прав і свобод людини і громадянина.

Statement of the problem and its connection with significant scientific and practical tasks. The question of distinguishing the principles of public administration and administrative law is a complex scientific task, which at the same time has a specific practical orientation, because it allows to personify the achievements of management science in a legal form and to consolidate them normatively. – legal acts of acquisition in the field of public administration as legal principles that are aimed at administrative legislation.

Analysis of the latest research and publications on which the author relies. Questions of the princi-

ples of administrative law and the principles of public administration were at one time actively generated in the scientific works of S.M. Alfiorov, V.M. Bevzenko, Yu.P. Bitiak, P.O. Baranchyk, S.A. Bondarchuk, V.O. Galai, N.V. Galitsyna, M.O. Germaniuk, O.V. Hlibko, T.O. Kovaliv M.V., Korenev O.P., Kolomoyets, R.V. Myronyuk, N.B. Pisarenko, A.A. Pukhtetska, D.V. Pryimachenko, S.G. Stetsenko et al.

Tackling previously unresolved parts of the general problem. In our opinion, the issue of distinguishing the principles of public administration from administrative law requires additional scientific argumentation and the continuation of scientific research in this area, because the above-mentioned studies drew attention to this problem, exacerbated it, but did not finally solve it, and therefore the question remains controversial so far.

Formation of goals (setting the task). The method of this study is the development of additional arguments in the field of distinguishing the principles of public administration and administrative law for the further formation of a weighted and balanced system of principles for the construction of administrative legislation in accordance with European standards for the provision of public services.

Presentation of the main material. The concept of principles of legal science came to philosophy, which in the process of its historical development revealed certain regularities inherent in the phenomena of social truth, which later found its reflection in the philosophy of law, and was included in the theoretical assets of the theory of law, the theory of public administration etc.

The principle (from the Latin principum – beginning, origin) in philosophy is the same as the basis, i.e., what lies at the basis of a certain set of facts and knowledge [15, 237].

A principle is the basic premise of any theory or doctrine, the basic principles of explanation or guidance for action [8, 9].

The principles of public administration are an important category of management science, the future of its foundations. Principles as a concept of theory reflect the essence and reality of the processes of public administration, subject to certain laws [12, 337].

Principles as basic ideas, basic principles have signs of universality, have a higher power when applied, embody in their main essential provisions the phenomena of reality that concern.

The principles of public administration should be distinguished from the principles of administrative law.

In the common law system, among other things, there is an opinion that "administrative law focuses almost entirely on external dimensions of administrative action, and the external dimensions it targets are increasingly not the main drivers of administrative action" [7, 1518].

As it was rightly noted, the main principles of the meaning of administrative law arise from the fact that they begin "legal destiny", viability, practical organization and real functioning of executive power and governance. The principles of administrative law are determined by the implementation of the principles of the functioning of the executive power, the state, state bodies and state administration, which are created by numerous subjects of law [6, 1068].

From the above, it can be seen that the authors of this confirmation apply the principles of "the functioning of the executive power, the state, state authorities and government" as the primary ones. Thus, it is the principles of state administration that determine the emergence and functioning of the principles of administrative law. We believe that we should agree with this confirmation, taking into account the fact that administrative law is understood as a set of legal norms that regulate social relations carried out in the process of public management of the economic, social-cultural and administrative-political spheres of life, as well as in the course of ensuring implementation and protection of the rights, freedoms and legitimate interests of individuals and legal entities from executive authorities and local self-government bodies [13, 7].

At the same time, public administration is understood as a political function, which is implemented through power-organizing activities, which involves joint work and people's lives, with the purpose of setting general societal goals and tasks [16, 10].

According to M.V. Kovaliv, the principles of public administration are the subject of the theory of public administration, the science of administrative law should focus on the analysis of problems of administrative and legal regulation and the installation of these principles in administration [11, 32]. Myroniuk R.V. [1, 20] noted that the method of administrative law is a set of methods of legal regulation, and the mechanism of administrative and legal regulation is a set of legal means. Despite the linguistic similarity, from the point of view of law, these are different terms, since the methods of legal regulation are: a) prescriptions; b) prohibitions; c) permits. At the same time, legal means are legal norms, legal relations, acts of realization of rights and obligations. Therefore, public administration and administrative law are objectively different phenomena, and therefore the principles of administrative law cannot be replaced by the principles of public administration.

Sharaia A.A. generally defines the principles of managerial activity as a potential basis for the formation of branch principles of administrative law [2, 83].

That is, we can talk about the relationship between the principles of state administration and the principles of administrative law, as a whole and a part.

Thus, we come to the conclusion that the principles of administrative law are inextricably linked and intertwined with the principles of public administration, while at the same time they are not completely identical to the principles of public administration.

The principles of administrative law are understood as basic (main) ideas, provisions, and requirements that characterize the content of administrative law, reflect the regularities of its development and determine the directions and mechanisms of administrative-legal regulation of social relations [1, 9].

According to V. V. Halunka, the principles of administrative law should be understood as the basic, objectively determined principles on which the activity of subjects of administrative law is based, the rights and freedoms of man and citizen, the normal functioning of civil society and the state are ensured [4] .

Attention is paid to the issue of the principles of administrative law in the works of, in particular, Korenev O.P., Tikhomirov Yu.O.[10; 14].

The mentioned authors list the principles of administrative law, but certain principles cannot be unambiguously attributed either to the principles of administration or to the principles of governance, for example, the principle of subordination of activity [17, 27]. This principle, in our opinion, is manifested both in administrative law (so any normative act of a lower hierarchical level must not contradict a normative act of higher legal force) and in state administration (the activities of a subject of state administration must be clearly regulated by a law or by-law normative act, while the law has a higher legal force).

Tikhomirov Yu.O. notes that with all its external declarative nature, the principles of administrative law are very important. They serve as the theoretical and cognitive foundation of the field and a kind of value reference for law-making and law enforcement in this field. Quite often, the principles enshrined in a law or other act receive a strict normative-orienting and system-forming meaning for all norms of a particular act, institution, or sub-industry [14, 84].

The principles of public administration are fundamental truths, positive laws, guiding ideas, basic provisions, norms of behavior that reflect the laws of the development of government relations, formulated in the form of a certain scientific position, established in the prevailing legal form, on the basis of which the apparatus of public administration is built and functions. which works to satisfy the public interest [12, 12].

Sereda V.V. defines the principles of public administration as manifestations of regularities in public administration, which are reflected in the form of certain provisions that are applied in the theoretical and practical activities of people in the sphere of public administration. As a rule, these are fundamental, scientifically based, and in certain cases, legally enshrined provisions, according to which the state administration system is built and functions [12, 19].

The principles of public administration should have objective governance phenomena and processes as their sources, reveal their nature and administrative role; correctly, on the basis of an accurate reflection of reality, to describe patterns, relations and interconnections of state-governmental reality; to be reflected in such a form that meets the requirements of dialectical logic, to show the essence of the defined state-governmental relationship, to promote the effective use of scientific knowledge in practice, Yes, Kovbasuk Yu.V. believes that these principles embody fundamental truths, positive laws, guiding ideas, basic provisions and norms of behavior that reflect the laws of development of governmental relations and are formulated in the form of scientific provisions, which are mostly fixed in legal forms. They form the basis for the construction and functioning of the state administration system [11, 109].

The principles are characterized by two features:

a) belonging to the positive regularities known by science and practice;

b) fixed in the public consciousness, on which the means of influence of state administration are directed [11, 138].

Thus, we can come to the conclusion that the principles of administrative law, first of all, determine the mechanism of legal regulation of (administrative) relations, are the basis of law, and influence its formation and development. That is, they actually express the nature of administrative law, determine its features, etc.

At the same time, the principles of public administration directly determine the mechanism of such administration and its organization and are implemented in the process of administrative activity. That is, we believe that the categories of principles of administrative law and principles of public administration should be studied together (comprehensively), without making a final demarcation (which, in our opinion, is impossible to make definitively and unequivocally), because it is in this case that the subject of our research can be fully disclosed.

We believe that in order to achieve a complete, clear understanding of the studied phenomenon, distinguishing it from other phenomena of legal reality, it is necessary to classify the principles of administrative law, the principles of public administration. To find out the "touch points"

of these legal phenomena, to analyze how the studied principles manifest themselves during the implementation of state administration in practice.

Thus, the principles of administrative law are traditionally divided into: general and special.

General principles are of fundamental importance for the entire field of administrative law. As a rule, they are revealed and detailed in special principles characteristic of certain institutions of administrative law: principles of public service, principles of administrative responsibility, principles of administrative process, administrative procedure, etc. [2, 83].

Yu.P. Bytiak divides the principles of administrative law into two groups: external and internal.

External principles are determined by the characteristics of the law itself as a certain formal and substantive legal phenomenon. Internal principles are determined by the requirements for the organization and functioning of administrative law. At the same time, the scientist notes that he considers the division into such categories quite conditional, since these are different aspects of the reproduction of the executive activity of the state [17, 30].

Special internal principles of administrative law include the following:

– compliance of administrative law with the provisions of the Constitution of Ukraine;

– the supremacy of the administrative-legal law in the system of normative acts, which contain administrative-legal norms;

– availability of own basis for formation and development;

– specialization;

– compliance of administrative and legal laws with certain provisions of international legal treaties on administrative law, to which Ukraine is a party [18, 31].

That is, in fact, the content of the internal principles of administrative law is determined by the peculiarities of administrative law as a field and the peculiarities of legal relations regulated by it.

Also, the principles of administrative law are divided into: general-social and special-branch.

At the same time Bytiak Y.P. notes that the system of general social principles is formed within the science of state theory and law, philosophy, sociology. The basis for distinguishing specifically branch principles of administrative law is, in fact, the executive activity of the state.

General legal principles are enshrined, first of all, in the Constitution of Ukraine, are specified and developed in legislative and other normative legal acts, and have their reflection both in administrative and legal relations, and in relations regulated by other branches of law. Special, also called sectoral (in our case – administrative-legal), principles are indicated and detailed in a specific field of law – administrative law.

General principles of administrative law include:

– principle of legality [1, 37];

– the principle of priority of human and citizen rights and freedoms;

– the principle of equality of citizens before the law;

– the democratic principle of rule-making and implementation of law;

– the principle of mutual responsibility of the state and man;

– the principle of humanism and justice in the relationship between the state and man.

The characteristic features of the principles of administrative law are the following [19, 62]:

1. They are formed in order to ensure the rights and freedoms of a person and a citizen and the normal functioning of civil society and the state.

2. They determine the most general and stable requirements that contribute to their approval and protection by subjects of public administration, determine the nature of administrative law and directions of its further development.

3. They establish guiding principles-instructions that determine the most important rules by which the activities of subjects of administrative law are carried out and organized.

4. The principles of administrative law are characterized by progressiveness, testify to the fundamental principles of behavior of subjects of administrative law that are ideal for modern conditions and are realistically achievable.

Thus, the principle of priority of the rights and freedoms of a person and a citizen is determined by the provisions of Art. 3 of the Constitution of Ukraine, namely: Man, his life and health, honor and dignity, inviolability and security are recognized as the highest social value in Ukraine. Human rights and freedoms and their guarantees determine the content and direction of state activity. The state is responsible to the people for its activities. Affirmation and provision of human rights and freedoms is the main duty of the state [9]. Given these provisions, state actions, including state administration, is primarily aimed at meeting the needs of people and citizens in a certain field, that is, state activity is designed to create appropriate conditions for the realization of citizens' rights.

The principle of equality of citizens before the law is also based on the provisions of the Constitution of Ukraine, namely Articles 21 and 22:

All people are free and equal in their dignity and rights. Human rights and freedoms are inalienable and inviolable.

There can be no privileges or restrictions based on race, skin color, political, religious and other beliefs,

gender, ethnic and social origin, property status, place of residence, language or other characteristics [9].

The principle of mutual responsibility of the state and the person during the exercise of public administration is based on the provisions of Art. 56 of the Constitution of Ukraine, namely: everyone has the right to compensation at the expense of the state or local self-government bodies for material and moral damage caused by illegal decisions, actions or inaction of state authorities, local self-government bodies, their officials and officials in the exercise of their powers [9].

The principle of humanism and justice in the relationship between the state and a person during the implementation of public administration is realized primarily in the state's provision of respect for a person, his dignity, putting a person and his interests first, that is, the humanistic orientation of the state's activities.

According to Y.P. Bytiak, the special branch principles of administrative law are [20, 176]:

– service of executive authorities and their apparatus to society and people;

– limited intervention of executive authorities in the civil and personal life of a person;

– full rights and freedoms of citizens in the administrative and legal sphere;

– mutual responsibility;

– determination of the minimum necessary powers of state executive bodies;

– optimal addition and balancing of the state-power powers of the executive authorities with the powers of the self-government bodies.

The next stage of our research is the analysis of the system of principles of public administration.

The system of principles of administrative law in general should contain:

– the principle of the rule of law;

– the principle of goof governance [3, 40].

The issue of classification of the principles of public administration is quite common in management theory. In particular, the authors of the textbook "Public Administration", prepared by the National Academy of Public Administration under the President of Ukraine, pay attention to the multifaceted criteria for classifying the principles of public administration and, summarizing the theoretical achievements in this field, talk about the following groups of principles: socio-political; organizational; organizational and political; organizational and technical; economic; organizational and legal; generally essential; kind; general; individual; socio-political; functional and structural; organizational and structural [12, 110].

National scientists distinguish three categories of administrative principles: system-wide, structural and specialized. System-wide principles include governance objectivity, democracy, legality, legal order, separation of powers, publicity, and a combination of centralization and decentralization [5, 94].

As can be seen from the above, the classifications of the principles of public administration are diverse and, depending on the position of their author, quite detailed. If desired, almost each of the above principles can be decomposed into component parts and determine the principles of its formation, functioning and application. It is also possible to determine the theoretical and practical aspects of these principles.

Conclusions and prospects for further research. In the context of the post-war reconstruction of the state and the alignment of public administration systems, completion of decentralization processes and correlation with the bodies established during the martial law period, it will be advisable to introduce a unified system for establishing general and special principles of administrative law and public administration, taking into account the European and EU experience.

Bibliography

1. Адміністративне право. Конспект лекцій. Конспект лекцій підготували: Миронюк Р.В. професор кафедри адміністративного права, процесу та адміністративної діяльності факультету ПФППД ДДУВС, доктор юридичних наук, професор. Дніпропетровський державний університет внутрішніх справ. Дніпро. 2016. https://dduvs.in.ua/wp-content/uploads/files/Structure/library/student/lectures/0905/11.1.pdf

2. А. Шарая. Класифікація принципівадміністративно-процедурного права. Национальный юридический журнал: теория и практика. National law journal: teory and practice. Jurnalul juridic na ional. Decembrie 2019. С. 81-86. http://www.jurnaluljuridic.in.ua/archive/2019/6/19.pdf

3. Загальне адміністративне право України : підручник / за заг. ред.: акад. С. Ківалова і проф. Л. Білої-Тіунової ; Нац. ун-т Одеська юрид. академія». Одеса : Фенікс, 2023. 792 с. http://dspace.onua.edu.ua/bitstream/handle/11300/25545/%D0%BF%D1%96%D0%B4%D1%80%D1%83%D1%87%D0%BD%D0%B8%D0%BA%20%D0%97%D0%B0%D0%B3%20%D0%B0%D0%B4%D0%BC%D1%96%D0%BD%D1%96%D1%81%D1%82%D1%80%20%D0%BF%D1%80.pdf?sequence=3&isAllowed=y

4. Принципи адміністративного права: лекція для студентів 2 курсу доктора юридичних наук, професора, голови Академії адміністративно-правових наук Валентина Галунька. 24.09.2019. https://www.ssaals.com.ua/pravo/pryntsypy-administratyvnoho-pravale/6628/

5. Коваль Г.В. та ін. Державне управління процесами запобігання та реагування надзвичайними ситуаціями: основні цілі та принципи. Міжнародна та національна безпека: теоретичні і прикладні аспекти. Матеріали IV Міжнародної науково-практичної конференції (ДДУВС, 13.03.2020). с. 93-95 https://er.dduvs.in.ua/bitstream/123456789/4582/1/26.pdf

6. Dragos, D.C., Langbroek, P.M. (2018). Law and Public Administration: A Love–Hate Relation-

ship?. In: Ongaro, E., Van Thiel, S. (eds) The Palgrave Handbook of Public Administration and Management in Europe. Palgrave Macmillan, London. https://doi.org/10.1057/978-1-137-55269-3_54. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/321370346_Law_and_Public_Administration_A_Love-Hate_Relationship

7. Gillian E. Metzger. 2015. Administrative Law, Public Administration, and the Administrative Conference of the United States, 83 George Washington Law Review. 1517–1539. Columbia Law School Scholarship Archive (2015). https://scholarship.law.columbia.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=2882&context=faculty_scholarship

8. Шатіло В. А. Загальнонаукові підходи до визначення принципів права та їх вплив на розвиток конституційного механізму державної влади / В. А. Шатіло/ Shatilo V. Theoretical approaches to defining the principles of law and their impact on the development of the constitutional mechanism of the state power // Публічне право (Public Law Magazine). 2019. № 2. С. 9-14. https://www.publichne-pravo.com.ua/files/34/pdf/pp-2019-34-01.pdf

9. Конституція України від 28 червня 1996 р. // Відомості Верховної Ради України. 1996. № 30. Ст. 141.

10. Коренев А. П. Принципы современного административного права // Правоведение, 1967, № 3, С. 72–78.

11. Ковалів, М.В. (Kovaliv, M.V.), Єсімов, С.С. (Yesimov, S.S.) та ін (at al). Принципи адміністративно-правового регулювання забезпечення економічної безпеки у контексті Стратегії національної безпеки України // Principles of Administrative and Legal Regulation of Providing Economic Security in the Context of the National Security Strategy of Ukraine. (Law & Sciences) Право та науки. 2018. № 1. С. 28–33. https://dspace.lvduvs.edu.ua/bitstream/1234567890/2683/1/Law%20%26%20Sciences_2018_1-29-34.pdf

12. Державне управління : підручник : у 2 т. / Нац. акад. держ. упр. при Президентові України ; ред. кол. : Ю. В. Ковбасюк (голова), К. О. Ващенко (заст. голови), Ю. П. Сурмін (заст. голови) [та ін.]. К. ; Дніпропетровськ : НАДУ, 2012. Т. 1. 564 с. https://ktpu.kpi.ua/wp-content/uploads/2014/02/DERZHAVNE-UPRAVLINNYA-2012.pdf

13. Середа В. В., Назар Ю. С., Костовська К. М. Адміністративне право України (у схемах та коментарях): навчальний посібник /В. В. Середа, Ю. С. Назар, К. М. Костовська. Львів: ЛьвДУВС, 2016. 300 с. https://dspace.lvduvs.edu.ua/bitstream/1234567890/341/1/%D0%90%D0%B4%D0%BC%D1%96%D0%BD%D1%96%D1%81%D1%82%D0%B8%D0%B2%D0%BD%D0%B5%20%D0%BF%D1%80%D0%B0%D0%B2%D0%BE%20%D0%B2%20%D1%81%D1%85%D0%B5%D0%BC%D0%B0%D1%85.pdf

14. Философская энциклопедия. Гл. ред. Ф.В. Константинов. «Советская энциклопедия», Ин-т философии АН СССР. Энциклопедии, Словари, Справочники). Т. 4 «Наука логики» – Сигети, 1967.

15. Tate J. The Origins of Greek Philosophy – F. M. Cornford: Principium Sapientiae. A Study of the Origins of Greek Philosophical Thought. Pp. vii 270. Cambridge: University Press, 1952. Cloth, 25s. net. The Classical Review. 1954;4(3-4):237-240. doi:10.1017/S0009840X00180746

16. Бакуменко В. Д., Усаченко Л. М., Червякова О. В. Теоретичні засади державного управління : навч. посіб. / В. Д. Бакуменко, Л. М. Усаченко, О. В. Червякова ; за заг. ред. Л. М. Усаченко. К. : ТОВ «НВП «Інтерсервіс», 2013. 174 с. https://moodle.znu.edu.ua/pluginfile.php/293303/mod_resource/content/1/%D0%A2%D0%B5%D0%BE%D1%80%D0%B5%D1%82%D0%B8%D1%87%D0%BD%D1%96%20%D0%B7%D0%B0%D1%81%D0%B0%D0%B4%D0%B8%20%D0%B4%D0%B5%D1%80%D0%B6%D0%B0%D0%B2%D0%BD%D0%BE%D0%B3%D0%BE%20%D1%83%D0%BF%D1%80%D0%B0%D0%B2%D0%BB%D1%96%D0%BD%D0%BD%D1%8F_%D0%BD%D0%B0%D0%B2%D1%87%D0%B0%D0%BB%D1%8C%D0%BD%D0%B8%D0%B9%20%D0%BF%D0%BE%D1%81%D1%96%D0%B1%D0%BD%D0%B8%D0%BA.pdf

17. Білкур Є.І. Функції державного управління: поняття, особливості, правове регулювання Дисертація на здобуття наукового ступеня кандидата юридичних наук. Національний університет «Одеська юрилична академія». Одеса. 2015. 194 с. http://dspace.onua.edu.ua/bitstream/handle/11300/2377/Diss_Bilokur.pdf?sequence=3&isAllowed=y

18. Адміністративне право України: Підручник / Ю. П. Битяк, В. М. Гаращук, О. В. Дьяченко та ін.; За ред. Ю. П. Битяка. К.: Юрінком Інтер, 2007, 544 с. http://kizman-tehn.com.ua/wp-content/uploads/2018/02/%D0%90%D0%B4%D0%BC%D1%96%D0%BD%D1%96%D1%81%D1%82%D1%80%D0%B0%D1%82%D0%B8%D0%B2%D0%BD%D0%B5-%D0%91%D0%B8%D1%82%D1%8F%D0%BA.pdf

19. Адміністративне право України. Повний курс : підручник / В. Галунько, П. Діхтієвський, О. Кузьменко та ін. ; за ред. В. Галунька, О. Правоторової. Видання четверте. Херсон : ОЛДІ-ПЛЮС, 2021. 656 с. http://dspace.onua.edu.ua/bitstream/handle/11300/15923/%D0%A5%D0%B0%D0%BC%D1%85%D0%BE%D0%B4%D0%B5%D1%80%D0%B0%20%D0%9E.%D0%9F.%D0%90%D0%B4%D0%BC%D1%96%D0%BD%D1%96%D1%81%D1%82%D1%80%D0%B0%D1%82%D0%B8%D0%B2%D0%BD%D0%B5%20%D0%BF%D1%80%D0%B0%D0%B2%D0%BE%20%D0%A3%D0%BA%D1%80%D0%B0%D1%97%D0%BD%D0%B8..pdf?sequence=4&isAllowed=y

20. Шарая А.А. Класифікація принципів адміністративного права. // Юридичний науковий електронний журнал. № 1, 2013. С. 174–177. http://www.lsej.org.ua/1_2013/ukr/Sharaya.pdf